

Minutes for the Historic District Commission Meeting on January 7, 2004

**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
PORTSMOUTH, NEW HAMPSHIRE
1 JUNKINS AVENUE
City Council Chambers**

PLEASE NOTE: Due to the length of the Agenda, **New Business, Old Business, Public Hearings and Work Sessions A through E will be heard on January 7, 2004, Work Sessions F through I and Public Hearing #5) will be heard on the following Wednesday, January 14, 2004** in the City Council Chambers at 7:00 p.m.

**January 3, 2004 - @ 9:15 a.m. - Site Walk – 21 Blossom Street
January 3, 2004 - @ 9:30 a.m. – Site Walk – 57 Marcy Street**

7:00 p.m.

JANUARY 7, 2004

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairman John Rice, Vice-Chairman David Adams, Members Rick Becksted, Ellen Fineberg, John Golomb, City Council Representative Joanne Grasso; Planning Board Representative Paige Roberts; and, Alternates. Richard Katz and Sandra Dika

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Roger Clum, Assistant Building Inspector

.....
I. NEW BUSINESS

A) Election of Officers

Mr. Becksted made a motion to nominate Mr. Rice as Chairman; Ms. Fineberg seconded and all agreed with a 9 – 0 vote.

Mr. Becksted made a motion to nominate Mr. Adams as Vice-Chairman; Mr. Golomb seconded and all agreed with a 9 – 0 vote.

Congratulations to both Chairman Rice and Vice-Chairman Adams for their continued support.

.....
B) Group Photo for the Web-site

At this time, the Commission members moved the group photo for the web-site to be taken at 9:00 p.m..

.....

II. OLD BUSINESS

A) Petition for Brina Lampert, owner, and Ed Moriarty, applicant, for property located at 202 Islington Street wherein permission is requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (remove existing signage on the top of front windows to raise front window from 72" to 103") as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 137 as Lot 021 and lies within the Central Business B and Historic A districts. This application was tabled at the December 3, 2003 meeting to the January 7, 2004 meeting.

Mr. Becksted made a motion to take the application off the table; Ms. Grasso seconded and was approved with a 7 – 0 vote.

Since there was no one present to speak to the application, Vice-Chairman Adams made a motion to move the application to end of the Agenda; Mr. Becksted seconded and was approved with a 7 – 0 vote.

.....

B) Work Session/Public Hearing for petition for Joseph and Jennifer Almeida, owners, for property located at 33 Blossom Street wherein permission is requested to allow the demolition of an existing garage and to allow a new free-standing structure (construction of a one and half story two car garage) as per plans on file in Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 110 as Lot 002 and lies within the General Residence B and Historic A districts. This application was tabled at the December 3, 2003 meeting to the January 7, 2004 meeting.

Vice-Chairman Adams made a motion to take the application off the table; Mr. Becksted seconded and all approved with a 7 – 0 vote.

CHAIRMAN RICE OPENED THE WORK SESSION

Mr. Almeida stated he has removed the skylights from his application on the garage that was discussed at the previous meeting and will be replaced with a small dormer. He presented an elevation drawing of the dormer on the garage to the Commission members to review as well as a spec sheet for the wood garage door that indicated true divided lights will be used.

Chairman Rice stated that this plan is much improved from what was presented last month.

Ms. Fineberg asked why the window on the first floor rear façade did not align with the window on the second floor rear facade? Mr. Almeida replied that it would not be a problem to align this window with the second floor window on the rear facade.

Chairman Rice closed the work session and opened the Public Hearing.

SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF THE APPLICATION

Mr. Almeida stated he would align the first floor window with the window on the second floor and added that nothing has changed from what he stated at the work session above.

ADDITIONAL SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF THE PETITION

Ms. Kathleen Beauchamp, a direct abutter to the rear of Mr. Almeida, stated she supports Mr. Almeida’s plans for the garage and has no objections to it.

SPEAKING IN OPPOSITION TO THE PETITION

Mr. Zabarsky, a direct abutter at 161 South Street, stated there are other three car garages in the area, but they do not have a second story, this garage is as large as a house and he added he is very much opposed to this application. This garage will block his light and air and it will destroy the streetscape in his area. Unfortunately, Ms. Beauchamp, the abutter who spoke in favor of this application, is requesting the same thing in a work session at the end of the Agenda.

There being no further speakers, the Public Hearing was closed.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Vice-Chairman Adams stated that for discussion purposes, he made a motion to approve the application with the stipulation that the window on the first floor on the rear façade align with the window above on the second floor. The garage is broader than a one car garage; however he added that he is not concerned with the size or the scale of the garage.

Chairman Rice stated the garage is not out of character; however he respects the comments of the abutter, Mr. Zabarsky; however, he added that he does disagree with his comments.

The motion to approved with the stipulation passed with a 7 – 0 vote.



III. PUBLIC HEARINGS

Let the record reflect that Mr. Golomb stepped down from the following public hearing and alternate, Richard Katz sat in.

1) Petition for Antonios Tzortzakis, owner, and Robert Cannon, applicant, for property located at 413-415 Islington Street wherein permission is requested to allow new construction to an existing structure (a one-story 165 s.f. addition being 11’ x 15’ in size and windows to match existing) as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 144 as Lot 33 and lies within the Mixed Residential Business and Historic A districts.

SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF THE APPLICATION

Chairman Rice stated he feels the application is incomplete and there is not enough information to make a decision. He feels a work session is in order.

Ms. Fineberg feels the application should come back next week at the reconvened meeting on January 14, 2004 for a work session and then a public hearing will be scheduled.

Ms. Fineberg made a motion to table the application to a work session; Ms. Grasso second and all approved with a 7 – 0 vote.

.....
2) Petition for Elisabeth Blaisdell, owner, for property located at 77 Newcastle Avenue wherein permission is requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (replace all windows with wood Brosco six over six windows with true-divided lights and replace two existing awning windows with windows to match the remainder of windows in size) as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 101 as Lot 50 and lies within the General Residence B and Historic A districts.

SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF THE APPLICATION

Ms. Blaisdell, the owner of the property, stated that all the windows in the house have deteriorated, they have rotted out, and are mismatched. She added that she has made many interior improvements on her house and now it is time for the exterior. The proposed windows will be Brosco six over six with true-divided lights. The trim will be replaced with new trim to match existing. Ms. Blaisdell stated there are two awning windows that will be replaced with six over six windows and will match the size of existing windows.

There being no further speakers, the Public Hearing was closed.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Mr. Becksted made a motion to approve as presented; Ms. Grasso seconded. Mr. Becksted stated that the applicant has given the Commission exactly what we require; therefore, this request can be granted.

The motion to approve passed with a 7 – 0 vote.

.....
3) Petition for Temple of Israel, owner, and Dr. Robert Chaikin, applicant, for property located at 200 State Street wherein permission is requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (up-grade exterior lighting and add additional lighting per recommendation of the Portsmouth Police Department for safety reasons) as per plans on file in Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 107 as Lots 65, 66 and 75 and lies within the Central Business B and Historic A districts.

SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF THE APPLICATION

Ms. Deena Stern, representing Temple of Israel, stated that the Portsmouth Police completed a safety survey and determined the area was very unsafe as it exists because of the placement of the existing lighting. She explained where new fixtures would be placed and where existing fixtures would be moved, at the recommendation of the Police

Department, of which the Commission members had a copy of the report as well as a manufacturer's spec sheet of the new fixtures.

There being no further speakers, the Public Hearing was closed.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Vice-Chairman Adams made a motion to approve as presented; Ms. Grasso seconded. Vice-Chairman Adams stated the new lights appear to be the same as the other lights; however, the only difference is that the conduits running along the side of the building are in disarray. He asked that the electrician on the project to run the conduits as neatly as possible on the exterior of the building..

Ms. Roberts stated she would like to address the Planning Board's perspective since she is the representative of the Planning Board. She asked about the spill-over of lighting and if it would affect nearby residential properties. The fixtures are not the most attractive, but she will vote in favor of the application,

Ms. Fineberg feels the lighting makes the building look like a prison and added this plan is not the solution. We are not trying to stop the use of this kind of lighting since there are other people who feel the lighting is okay. She feels that the proposed plan will make the area more secure but other solutions to the fixtures should be looked at.

Ms. Grasso stated that if the applicant would like to make changes to the approved plan, they can return to the Commission for an amendment.

Chairman Rice stated he feels that the committee for the Temple of Israel should be encouraged to look at other solutions.

The motion to approve passed with a 6 – 1 vote with Ms. Fineberg voting in the negative.



4) Petition for Smith, Minch and Frost Properties, LLC, owners, and Sumner Davis Architects, applicant, for property located at 159-165 State Street wherein permission is requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (masonry repair, new and replacement windows, re-working fire escapes, clapboard and roof repair, and ventilation/air conditioning equipment) as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 107 as Lot 46-3 and lies within the Central Business B and Historic A districts.

SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF THE APPLICATION

Mr. Kelly Davis, representing the owners, reviewed the plans they are proposing to repair and re-point the brick, restore of the roof, replace the front door with a wood door. Mr. Davis stated he has discussed some of the proposed changes with Mr. Hopley, the Building Inspector. Two windows will be larger in size because a second means of egress is needed. Marvin true divided light windows will be used with an aluminum storm sash. However, on the rear, the owners would like to hold back on any changes until they get through the budget process.

Mr. Davis stated that on the third floor there are some crowns on the windows missing and will use a crown that is in good shape to make a template to construct crowns that are missing. We are also thinking about erecting fencing; however, we have not come to an agreement yet as to what we will use; therefore, we will return for approval for this and other plans as they develop.

Mr. Davis stated the windows will be three over three or six over six; however, the plans do show that there will be some four over four windows. There are two proposed concrete egress windows being proposed to meet code that will be set in window wells.

Mr. Davis presented a sample of the hardware that will be used on the front door and added the rear door will be replaced in kind.

Vice-Chairman Adams inquired about what kind of mullions would be used and the mullion width? Mr. Davis replied the mullions will be wood and 7/8" to show a shadow. A high efficiency gas boiler is being proposed and will have a side wall vent. Vice-Chairman Adams replied he would like to see the location of the boiler when the time comes for approval. Mr. Davis stated he did not want the mechanicals placed on the roof of the building since no one wants to see a bunch of mechanicals sticking out of the roof. The shingles on the roof will be in the Architectural series. There is room to have a mechanical room in the basement that would be very clean.

Mr. Dodge a direct abutter, inquired about the size of the window on the first floor? Mr. Davis replied 32" x 36". The window on the second floor will have an arch impediment. Mr. Dodge asked that the application not be approved without the Commission viewing the brick and mortar selection.

Mr. Davis stated that four condenser units are being proposed that have will be 77 decibels each; however, when the noise is reflected off the brick, the decibel level will be brought up to about 80. The condensers are a big issue for this application.

Mr. Clum, the Assistant Building Inspector, stated he had a discussion with Mr. Dodge prior to the meeting, that if the Commission approves the application as proposed, the applicant still has to prove that the mechanicals do not exceed the noise level of the Ordinance.

Mr. Davis stated he needed to do some research and discuss the option of moving the condensers off the ground and placing them on the roof.

There being no further speakers, the Public Hearing was closed.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Ms. Fineberg made a motion to approve the application as presented; Ms. Roberts seconded.

Ms. Grasso inquired if the Commission could proceed with the application even if we do not know where the condensers will be located or if the decibel level proves to be too high.

Mr. Clum replied if the decibel level is more than the Ordinance allows, then the applicant would not be able to receive a permit.

At this time, Ms. Fineberg stated she would like to revise her motion to reflect the following stipulations:

1.
 - that the HDC review placement of the brownstone and materials to be used on the building;
 - that brick and mortar samples be reviewed;
 - As well as materials used on the third floor window lintels. .

Mr. Becksted stated he would like to appoint Vice-Chairman Adams to review these items; Ms. Fineberg agreed to the amendment as well as Ms. Roberts.

Mr. Golomb stated he was bothered about the measurements on the first floor of the plan because they could be more accurate.

Vice-Chairman Adams stated he agreed with Mr. Golomb and added that the blueprint plan should definitely be more accurate. The idea of the pediments is something that could be done. Vice-Chairman Adams added that he is very excited about the building being re-habed and realizes that Mr. Davis has many people to answer to.

The motion with the above stipulations passed with a 7 – 0 vote.



IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Vice-Chairman Adams made a motion to approve the minutes from the meeting of December 3, 2003; Mr. Becksted seconded and all agreed with a 7 – 0 vote.



V. WORK SESSIONS

A) Work Session/Public Hearing for William F. Hopkins, owner, for property located at 57 Marcy Street wherein permission is requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (replace three (3) windows on the first floor with twelve over twelve aluminum clad windows with simulated divided lights as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 104 as Lot 002 and lies within the General Residence B and Historic A districts. This application was tabled at the December 3, 2003 meeting to the January 7, 2004 meeting for a work session.

Chairman Rice opened the Work Session

Mr. Gary McGlone, representing the owner, stated that the site walk on Saturday with the Commission members was very beneficial for everyone. The sills will be screwed into the walls. He asked the Commission members to refer to the photographs that were in their packets showing different options on the windows. Chairman Rice stated he feels the proposed plan is institutional looking. Mr. McGlone stated he could move the windows in a little bit.

Mr. Katz asked if the Commission should indicate a depth? Vice-Chairman Adams replied the windows should match existing and we are all going to be hopeful that this is done.

Vice-Chairman Adams stated that once the sash is setback approximately 1", will you be able to do this trick with the sill? Mr. McGlone replied that this will be done.

At this time Chairman Rice closed the work session and opened the public hearing; the action was seconded and approved unanimously with a 7 – 0 vote..

SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF THE PUBLIC HEARING

Mr. McGlone stated that he will do what the Commission has recommended as well as place the windows with a 1" setback from the wall to the original depth; that the window sills be fabricated to match original window sills; and, that the casing duplicate the original casing.

There being no further speakers, the Public Hearing was closed.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Vice-Chairman Adams made a motion to approve the application with the following stipulations:

- That the windows be setback 1" from the wall to the original depth;
- That the window sills be fabricated to match original window sills; and,
- That the casing duplicate the original casing.

Mr. Golomb seconded and all agreed with a 7 – 0 vote.



B) Work Session requested by Carol and Barry Shore, owners, and Robert Rodier, architect, for property located at 91 South Street. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 102 as Lot 046 and lies within the General Residence B and Historic A districts. (Construct a 14' x 18' 1-1/2 story addition onto an existing exterior deck footprint; add a 5' x 10' one story addition at rear; and revise roof configuration of existing garage).

There was no present to speak to the work session, the Commission voted to table the work session to the next scheduled meeting on February 4, 2004.



C) Work Session requested by James P. D'Alessio, Inc. for property owned by Temple of Israel located at 200 State Street. Said property is shown on Assess Plan 107 as Lots 65, 66, and 75 and lies within the Central Business B and Historic A districts. (Renovations and expansions to the Community Center, entrance/lobby, parking and exterior façade. Upgrades and improvements to mechanical systems, circulation, safety and ADA compliance as well as aesthetic improvements to grounds.)

- Mr. D'Alessio has been working on renovations for this property for the past year ;
- The last renovation to the building was in 1967 and it is very modern and was completed before the HDC came into existence:
- The proposed work session will be very helpful to allow us to further explore what options we have;
- Presented copies of the building exterior to the Commission members;
- The Court Street façade will be our primary focus;
- Proposing a 20' x 65' two story addition on the on the side of the building that does not have street frontage;
- Parking will be increased at the site;
- We are proposing to eliminate the curb cut;
- Proposing to put another level of parking on;
- The wall will be brick or possibly granite;
- The applicant will return for another work session at the next scheduled meeting on February 4, 2004.

.....

D) Work Session requested by Anne Whitney, Architect for property owned by Kathleen Beauchamp located at 21 Blossom Street. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 110 as Lot 003 and lies within the General Residence B and Historic A districts. (Remove existing one-story garage and replace with a one-1/2 story garage; build a one-story addition between existing residence and new garage that will include an entry porch.)

- Ms. Whitney presented a site plan of the property showing where the addition will be placed;
- Plans indicate existing garage will be removed;
- A 16' x 20' one and a half story garage is being proposed;
- A 15' x 16' connector between the garage and the main house is being proposed with an entry porch;
- The reasons for the additions are because Ms. Beauchamp's fiancé has a disability that requires that he be inside. The small cape will be converted into one story living for him;
- Windows will be Eagle double hung with divided lights;
- The Commission asked if there was a way to soften the look of the pitch of the roof;
- The Commission felt this is a darling cape that already has a couple of additions on it and what is being proposed is crowding;
- The proposed garage is bigger than the house;
- Ms. Whitney stated you would not want to live in this house without having some protection to get inside;
- Mr. Zabarsky, a direct abutter stated that zoning requires 25' setback from the property line and the Board of Adjustment granted a 4-1/2' setback from his property line. This is blocking air and light to his property;
- Ms. Beauchamp stated this is a disability case and we are trying to do the best we can;
- The Commission feels that you run into problems when you get into quality of life issues and we are a Design Review Board;

- The Commission felt that the connector from the main house to the garage should be larger and the garage should be smaller;
- The Commission asked about the function of the door on the garage? Ms. Whitney explained it was for the lawn mower as well as an egress to the back yard;
- Ms. Whitney and Ms. Beauchamp indicated they would be back for another work session on February 4, 2004.

.....

E) Work Session requested by Mary and Erik Maurer, owners, for property located at 65 Rogers Street. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 115 as Lot 002 and lies within the Mixed Residential Office and Historic A districts. (Change house from a duplex to a single family; demolish a neglected barn and replace with a barn on same footprint; attach barn to house and move southerly 4' away from property line); add a half story walk-up; raise existing roof to 5'6" to accommodate for headroom; and renovate existing three-season porch.)

- Frank Hyer, the Architect for the project, stated the applicant is converting their duplex home into a single family home since the owner's have one child and are now expecting twins next week;
- The existing barn is right on the property line and we will be maintaining the same footprint only bring the barn in so that it does not impose on the setbacks anymore than what is existing;
- Proposing two skylights on the third floor on the south façade and this is our busiest elevation;
- Existing barn will be demolished;
- New barn will create storage and a play room for the children upstairs in the garage;
- Clapboards will be used on the barn.
- The Commission feels the proposed windows on rear are uncharacteristic for the house and the neighborhood because they are so small;
- The Commission would like to see the fenestration re-worked;
- A Commission member feels that some of the windows are quite large and there are windows that are almost non-existent;
- The Commission advised the applicant to make sure that skylights are needed since justification will be needed;
- The Commission feels the center section of the plans should be smaller and the barn larger;
- The height of the structure should be increased;
- A Commission member feels the barn should be called a shed;
- The Commission members feel the cornice line should be changed; and that another work session should be scheduled;
- The applicant agreed that another work session would be in order and will return to the February 4, 2004 HDC meeting.

.....

IV. ADJOURNMENT

At 10:45 p.m., the motion was made, seconded, and approved unanimously to adjourn the meeting and meet at the reconvened meeting on January 14, 2004 to complete the Agenda in the City Council Chambers.

Respectfully submitted,

Joan M. Long
Secretary

/jml