

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
ONE JUNKINS AVENUE, PORTSMOUTH, NEW HAMPSHIRE**

EILEEN DONDERO FOLEY COUNCIL CHAMBERS

7:00 p.m.

**October 13, 2010
reconvened from October 6, 2010**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairman Sandra Dika; Vice Chairman Richard Katz; Members John Wyckoff, Elena Maltese; City Council Representative Anthony Coviello; Alternate George Melchior

MEMBERS EXCUSED: Tracy Kozak; Alternate Joseph Almeida

ALSO PRESENT: Roger Clum, Assistant Building Inspector

.....
Prior to the meeting at 6:15 p.m., a site walk was held at 335 Maplewood Avenue.

I. OLD BUSINESS

A. Approval of minutes – August 18, 2010

It was moved, seconded, and passed unanimously (6-0) to approve the minutes as presented.

B. Petition of **Worth Development Corporation, owner, and Friends of the Music Hall, applicant**, for property located at **131 Congress Street**, wherein permission is requested to allow exterior renovations (replace window with recessed balcony, replace recessed balcony with window and rear elevation) as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 126 as Lot 6 and lies within the Central Business B, Historic, and Downtown Overlay Districts. *(This item was postponed at the October 6, 2010 meeting to the October 13, 2010 meeting.)*

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Mr. Wyckoff made a motion to postpone the application to the November 3, 2010 meeting. The motion was seconded by Councilor Coviello. The motion passed by a unanimous (6-0) vote.

II. PUBLIC HEARINGS (CONTINUED)

11. Petition of **Harbour Place Group, LLC, owner, and Judson and Christine Ludeking, applicants**, for property located at **1 Harbour Place**, wherein permission was requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (replace window with recessed balcony, replace recessed balcony with window) as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is

shown on Assessor Plan 105 as Lot 2 and lies within Central Business A, Historic, and Downtown Overlay Districts.

SPEAKING TO THE PETITION

Mr. Andy Tobin of North and South Custom Builders was present to speak to the application. He stated that the owner would like to relocate a previously approved balcony to a window location and move the window to the current balcony location. He pointed out that the exterior would remain consistent with the other balconies on the building.

Chairman Dika asked if the current recessed balcony was the one that was approved. Mr. Tobin replied yes and explained that the previously approved balcony was on the Daniel Street façade and the owners would like the balcony to be on the river side of the building. He would replace the current balcony with a window.

Ms. Maltese asked if the materials would remain the same. Mr. Tobin replied yes but stated that the floor tile in the balcony area may be different. He clarified that anything that was visible would remain the same.

Chairman Dika asked if there were any more questions for the applicant. Hearing none, she asked if anyone from the public wished to speak to, for, or against the application. Seeing no one rise she declared the public hearing closed and awaited a motion.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Ms. Maltese made a motion to grant a Certificate of Approval for the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Councilor Coviello. Chairman Dika asked for discussion.

Ms. Maltese stated that this was a discussion that the Commission has already had and so they were prepared for this request. She said that the request did not change the general feel or the size of the building.

Hearing no other discussion, Chairman Dika called for the vote. The motion to grant a Certificate of Approval for the application as presented passed by a unanimous (6-0) vote.

12. Petition of **Allen R. Nelson and Karen L. Bouffard, owners**, for property located at **225 Marcy St**, wherein permission was requested to allow a new free standing structure (install fencing) as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 103 as Lot 11 and lies within the General Residence B and Historic Districts.

SPEAKING TO THE PETITION

Ms. Karen Bouffard, owner of the property was present to speak to the application. She stated that she would like to install a fence on her property. The proposed fence was a closed top baluster

fence that would be facing the street. She also wanted to place a 6 foot solid board fence between her property and the neighbor.

Mr. Wyckoff asked if an arbor would be installed over the gate. Ms. Bouffard replied yes. Ms. Maltese asked if the arbor would be over the driveway on Marcy Street. Ms. Bouffard replied yes.

Chairman Dika asked if there were any more questions for the applicant. Hearing none, she asked if anyone from the public wished to speak to, for, or against the application. Seeing no one rise she declared the public hearing closed and awaited a motion.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Mr. Wyckoff made a motion to grant a Certificate of Approval for the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Councilor Coviello. Chairman Dika asked for discussion.

Mr. Wyckoff stated that this was a classic historic fence and adding the arbor was a nice touch.

Hearing no other discussion, Chairman Dika called for the vote. The motion to grant a Certificate of Approval for the application as presented passed by a unanimous (6-0) vote.

13. Petition of **JEDA Revocable Trust, Darleen MacFadyen and Jeff Paolini, trustees and owners**, for property located at **272-274 New Castle Avenue**, wherein permission was requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (remove asphalt siding, replace with clapboard siding, remove and replace windows) as per plans on file in the Planning Department. Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 207 as Lot 37 and lies within the Single Residence B and Historic Districts.

SPEAKING TO THE PETITION

Mr. Jamie Paolini, representative for the owners of the property was present to speak to the application. He said that the owner would like to replace the siding, windows, and trim. He explained that the clapboard siding was currently covered by an asphalt siding. They would like to remove it and replace it with new clapboards and trim to match. The windows would be replaced with 6 over 6 Andersen Woodright windows.

Chairman Dika asked if the windows would have a permanently affixed exterior grill. Mr. Paolini said that the window would have a fixed grill inside and out and would also have a spacer bar.

Mr. Wyckoff commented that the rear porch was much deteriorated. He wondered if there was any work planned for it. Mr. Paolini explained that it was actually a side porch and they were not sure what they were going to do with it so they would come back before the Commission when the final decision was made. He said that they would probably have to remove that whole section. Chairman Dika informed Mr. Paolini that he would need to come back to the Commission for approval to remove it and replace it.

Councilor Coviello asked what they were planning to do with the corner boards. Mr. Paolini said that they would match the existing corner boards with a 1” x 6” board.

Chairman Dika asked if there were any more questions for the applicant. Hearing none, she asked if anyone from the public wished to speak to, for, or against the application. Seeing no one rise she declared the public hearing closed and awaited a motion.

DECISION OF THE COMMISSION

Ms. Maltese made a motion to grant a Certificate of Approval for the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Councilor Coviello. Chairman Dika asked for discussion.

Ms. Maltese stated that this was a house that would have seriously deteriorated without some attention. It was a beautiful house in an amazing location in Portsmouth. She said that not only was the application appropriate it was preservation as well.

Hearing no other discussion, Chairman Dika called for the vote. The motion to grant a Certificate of Approval for the application as presented passed by a unanimous (6-0) vote.

III. WORK SESSIONS

Councilor Coviello stated that he would be recusing himself from Work Session A.

A. Work Session requested by **Thirty Maplewood Avenue, LLC, owner**, for property located at **30 Maplewood Avenue**, wherein permission was requested to allow a new free standing structure (construct 4-5 story mixed use building). Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 125 as Lot 2 and lies within the Central Business B, Historic, and Downtown Overlay Districts.

- Ms. Jennifer Ramsey of Somma Studios was present to speak to the application. She explained to the Commission that she would be speaking in conceptual terms about the project. She showed the Commission a site plan indicating where the proposed structure would be located on the site. Ms. Ramsey explained that this would be a separate building from the Hanover Market building that is currently on the site.
- The Maplewood Avenue elevation showed a five story building and that would be 55 feet in height. The penthouse would be recessed back 16 feet from the front of the building. Ms. Ramsey stated that they were looking at proposing a third floor on the Hanover Market building which would help to ease the transition to the larger structure.
- The Deer Street elevation showed how the structure would wrap around the existing VFW building. The site would have below grade parking and would be entered from this elevation. She pointed out that this portion of the building and along Bridge Street would be three stories. She said that the footprint might not extend all of the way back or it might possibly be a stand alone building along the Bridge Street side of the site.
- Ms. Ramsey said that they were looking at using a mix of materials.
- Vice Chairman Katz commented that the design seemed to be moving beyond the influences of the Hanover Market. He asked if that was deliberate on the applicant’s part. Ms. Ramsey explained how she came to the design before them. Vice Chairman Katz

added that he did not see anything that would cause damage to the fabric of the historic district.

- Ms. Maltese asked if the VFW would be staying. Ms. Ramsey replied that currently it would be staying. Ms. Maltese stated that she was not comfortable with the massing. She felt it was a huge loss of open space. It also would completely shadow the VFW. She questioned whether it would be economically viable for the applicant to build a smaller building. Ms. Ramsey pointed out that the fifth floor would be pulled in quite a bit and would not be that visible. Ms. Maltese said that the fifth floor would be visible when walking down the hill on Deer Street.
- Mr. Wyckoff stated that he thought they should bring some of the Hanover Market theme to the new building. He also said that he was having trouble with the massing but it was more the three story wrap around building. He felt it was too generic in that location and should stand a little stronger. Ms. Maltese agreed with Mr. Wyckoff concerning the three story portion.
- Chairman Dika said that with the configuration of the buildings that are there now, she was not happy with anything over three stories.
- Ms. Ramsey explained that they did not want this to be a showcase building. This would be a “today” building so the detailing would be representational of that. Chairman Dika stated that the Commission did not want this to look like just any other building in the downtown area. Ms. Maltese agreed.
- Mr. Melchior commented that the massing would be challenging. He suggested using the southern exposure to their benefit and stagger the roof line to allow sunlight in which would minimize the impact of the massing. He said the view from the hill on Deer Street would be difficult and they should take another look at the height.
- Vice Chairman Katz pointed out the towering back of the Music Hall that can be seen from Islington Street. He said it was part of Portsmouth’s historic nature and cautioned the Commission of trying to design some utopian paragon of good architecture.
- Ms. Ramsey asked the Commission what they thought of the mixing of the materials. The Commission expressed no concern with that.

B. Work Session requested by **Bradford C. and Alyssa A. Duncan, owners**, for property located at **36 Rogers Street**, wherein permission was requested to allow new construction to an existing structure (construct second story addition). Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 116 as Lot 46 and lies within the Mixed Residential Office, Historic, and Downtown Overlay Districts.

- Mr. Joe Almeida and Mr. Brad Duncan were present to speak to the application. Mr. Almeida gave the Commission packets that were distributed at the recent Board of Adjustment meeting. He said that they received approval for a side setback issue.
- Mr. Almeida explained that the house currently has a one story addition that was constructed in the mid 1990’s. They would now like to extrude upward to create a second story for a second bedroom.
- Mr. Almeida stated that the challenge with this addition was typing the existing windows on the first floor to the new windows above that. He said that he welcomed the Commission’s suggestions.
- Mr. Wyckoff stated that the windows and the addition were very awkward. He said that it was a difficult addition to build. There was considerable discussion concerning the window pattern. Councilor Coviello thought it might help to eliminate the shutters. Mr. Almeida explained that the internal space was driving the window pattern.

- Councilor Coviello asked if they had explored using a different siding material such as a shake to separate the upper and lower sections. Mr. Almeida said that he had not considered that. He added that before they come back for a public hearing, they will explore all of the options.
- Mr. Wyckoff stated that he found the flat roof awkward. He asked how visible the sides of the house were. Mr. Almeida replied fairly visible.
- Mr. Wyckoff asked Mr. Almeida what style of house he thought this was. Mr. Almeida said it was a New Englander, built around 1900. He said the home had 9 ½ foot ceilings with very large window openings.
- Mr. Melchior stated that he did not think the addition was inappropriate. Mr. Duncan added that it was completely typical of the neighborhood.
- Mr. Wyckoff stated that in the context of the neighborhood, then the addition might be appropriate but for a New Englander, he felt it was inappropriate.
- Mr. Almeida said that the issues Mr. Wyckoff has brought up were the same issues that they have wrestled with. He pointed out that these were just conceptual drawings.
- Chairman Dika stated that it seemed that the big issue was the windows. She asked if there was anything else.
- Mr. Almeida asked the Commission what they thought of the small windows on the back of the structure. He said that this area of the home is rarely seen.
- Vice Chairman Katz pointed out that there were a lot of things going on in the area. He said that a lot of the architecture was determined by need and in his opinion, it seems to work. Mr. Almeida said that to support that point they will take 360 degrees photos for the public hearing.
- Chairman Dika commented that she was very familiar with the area and this was typical of what has been done to other houses in the area. She was not sure if it was the most wonderful thing to have evolved in the area but fact was that it has.

Councilor Coviello and Ms. Maltese stated that they would be recusing themselves from the discussion.

C. Work Session requested by **Cooper Malt, LLC, owner**, for property located at **11 Jewel Court**, wherein permission was requested to allow exterior renovations to an existing structure (renovate existing building). Said property is shown on Assessor Plan 155 as Lot 5 and lies within the Business and Historic Districts.

- Mr. Steve McHenry and Mr. Brandon Holben of McHenry Architecture and Mr. John Gale and Mr. Chris Griner, co-founders of 3 S Art Space were present to speak to the application. Mr. McHenry explained that Mr. Gale and Mr. Griner would be the major tenants of the space and a lot to the aesthetic considerations with the reuse of this building had to do with their particular type of use.
- Mr. McHenry stated that the building as been there for over 100 years. The building was part of the old Schultz brew yard and this particular building was the fermenting hall.
- Mr. Gale explained that they would be the core tenant of the fermentation building. Three S was a non-profit arts organization that would occupy the first floor (10,000 sq. feet) of

the building. He said that the space would consist of 300 capacity performance space, 1,800 square foot gallery and restaurant. Three S stands for “three spaces.” He added that it was their hope to eventually take over the second floor and the tower.

- Mr. McHenry also explained how this project would mesh with the Islington Street Corridor Action plan.
- A power point presentation was viewed concerning the scope of the project. Following the presentation, Mr. McHenry passed out preliminary designs for the site.
- Chairman Dika stated that this was an important building and she was happy that someone was stepping forward with some ideas.
- Vice Chairman Katz commented that this area was prime territory for the idea of introducing new elements to an historic structure. He said it has been done in other places successfully and he thought it was exciting and was looking forward to it.
- Mr. Wyckoff liked the idea of wrapping the third floor truss elements. He said that it looked like it should be there. He also liked the new narrow windows next to the existing windows.
- Mr. Melchior stated that he liked this design because he liked contemporary architecture. He also liked the program and thought it was unique, bold and refreshing. He felt this was a great starting point but he thought they could go further with regard to the concept and the originality. Chairman Dika agreed and said that she thought the concept was exciting.
- Mr. McHenry told the Commission that he appreciated their open-mindedness with the project.

Chairman Dika informed the Commission that she would like to hold work session #2 soon to discuss green architecture and green building methods. She hoped to hold it at the second meeting in November. It was also suggested to have guest speakers to discuss manmade materials.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

At 8:25 p.m., it was moved, seconded, and passed unanimously to adjourn the meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Liz Good
HDC Recording Secretary

These minutes were approved at the Historic District Commission meeting on December 8, 2010.